Quantitative Service Delivery Survey
(QSDS)

Albert Rwego Kavatiri, TI-RW Program Manager

February 19, 2021
OUTLINE OF THE PRESENTATION

1. Background
2. Objectives
3. Methodology
4. Demographics
5. Findings
6. Recommendations
BACKGROUND

The survey was conducted under the project “Social Accountability Tools to Explore COVID-19 Response Effects on Beneficiaries of Social-Protection Programs in Rwanda” which was initiated by Transparency International Rwanda (TI-RW)

COVID-19 OUTBREAK

• In March 2020, in order to contain the spreading of COVID-19 countrywide, the Government of Rwanda resorted to extreme measures such as the lockdown which created a state of emergency and this situation negatively impacted on the economically vulnerable citizens

• At the same time, TI-RW received citizens’ complaints on lack of transparency in distribution of Government emergency support to affected citizens, corruption in service delivery in other health services (out of COVID-19 response), limited information on Government of Rwanda COVID-19 economic mitigation measures among other concerns
The overall aim of conducting the survey was to assess the fairness, integrity, transparency and accountability of service provision in Rwanda during the COVID-19 pandemic.
THE SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES

1. Analyze the level of awareness of COVID-19 preventive measures in the community.
2. Analyze the effectiveness of communication channels about the preventive measures of COVID-19.
3. Examine the level of satisfaction of citizens with regard to services received during the lockdown period.
4. Identify the reasons for dissatisfaction if any.
5. Analyze the extent of transparency, accountability, fairness, integrity in the delivery chain of services and support from the government officials (compliance assessment).
6. Analyze the impact of COVID-19 restrictions on citizens’ primary needs such as access to health care (e.g. for those with chronic disease, those without medical insurance, etc.), access on the markets and affordability of prices, access to banks.
7. Identify groups most affected by the lockdown and analyze its impact on their daily life
8. Identify possible challenges and mitigations associated with the implementation of COVID-19 preventive measures for both the government officials and the community.
METHODOLOGY

Approaches

Mixed methods of data collection (quantitative and qualitative)

Quantitative perspective
The study involved a structured questionnaire to collect citizens’ opinions and experiences on dimensions described in the specific objectives.

Qualitative approach
Qualitative approach was used to triangulate, understand and interpret the quantitative data. These included Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), Key Informants Interviews (KII), and desk review techniques.
Data collection: Quantitative data was collected by experienced Enumerators under the supervision of Team Leaders and Supervisors while FGDs, KIIIs were facilitated by Assistant Researchers under the coordination of the Lead Consultants. During data collection, TI-RW ensured that preventive measures on Covid-19 spread were observed by the research team.

Data processing and analysis: Quantitative data captured in the tablets by enumerators and submitted on daily basis to the data analyst. The data analyst generated statistical outcomes on the basis of the tabulation plan.

Quality assurance measures: A set of measures to ensure quality of data were observed.
METHODOLOGY

Study population:

general public aged 18 years and above, in Rwanda.

The selection of respondents was purposive because it based on those who were most vulnerable to COVID-19 restrictions such as motorcyclists, casual workers, teachers, members of the private sector, etc.

Sampling strategy and sample size

The sample size was computed using the formula below:

\[ n = \frac{N (zs/e)^2}{N + (zs/e)^2} \]

Where: 
\[ z = 1.96 \] for 95% level of confidence;
\[ s = p(1-p) \] p = estimated proportion;
\[ e = \text{desired margin of error}; \]
\[ N = \text{population size} \]

The sample size for the survey was computed as 2430 respondents which was actually estimated at 2442 after the data collection. The sample size was distributed in 15 districts, at least 10 FGDs and 10 KIIIs were conducted in the selected districts.
**DEMOGRAPHICS**

**GENDER**
- Male: 65.8%
- Female: 33.9%

**AGE GROUP**
44% of the respondents are in age group of 30 years and below.

**Employment status**
- Unemployed: 4.50%
- Fixed-term employee: 7.30%
- Casual employee: 10.90%
- Permanent: 22.60%
- Self-employed: 54.70%

Majority of respondents (68.5%) have between 1 and 5 dependents in their households.

**EDUCATION**
- 43.7% of the respondents have completed primary education
- 24.5% completed secondary

**DISTANCE**

Majority of respondents. Less than 2kms distance to
- School
- Market
- Next main road
- Next health center
FINDINGS
AWARENESS OF COVID-19 PREVENTIVE MEASURES IN THE COMMUNITY

96.2% of respondents have heard about coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic and its preventive measures.

Net Frequency (always and often) of information channels on COVID-19 preventive measures:

- 85.5% Rwanda Broadcasting Agency
- 69.8% Telephone message
- 68% Road vehicles with loud Speakers
- 52.6% Private Media
- 47.6% COVID 19 Hotline (114)
- 42.4% National COVID19 information website
- 10.8% Drones' messages

The high level of community awareness explains the high compliance of people with the COVID-19 preventive measures as shown in the following section.
SOURCE OF INFORMATION

Net Frequency of information about COVID-19 preventive measures by different information sources

- Rwanda National Police (RNP): 87.80%
- Ministry of health (MoH) through Rwanda Biomedical Center (RBC): 86.20%
- Ministry of Local Government: 83.30%
- Message from COVID-19 Volunteers: 81.00%
- Community Health Workers (CWHs): 71.20%
- Private media outlets: 67.40%
- FBOs: 59.10%
- Local NGOs: 50.90%
- Celebrities and social media influencers: 45.00%
- Private Sector Federation (PSF): 33.10%
These results reflect an extensive and effective dissemination of the relevant information which prompted the public to become compliant with the COVID-19 preventive measures.
LEVEL OF PEOPLES’ COMPLIANCE WITH COVID-19 PREVENTIVE MEASURES IN PUBLIC GATHERING SPACES

“I am confident that with the high-level leadership, the resilience of the Rwandans, swift action taken by the government, and support from the World Bank and other development partners, Rwanda can bend the curve on this pandemic and get back on track”.

The World Bank Country Manager for Rwanda in his press release of 1st May 2020
In early March 2020, a taskforce was put in place and guidelines were issued on social distancing and handwashing.

A systematic control in terms of complying with the established guidelines immediately started with the assistance from security organs and local leaders.
# Level of Satisfaction of Service Delivery or Support from Government Officials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government restrictions controlling bodies delivered fair services to me without bias of any kind</td>
<td>88.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security forces and local leaders treated me with an unbiased attitude</td>
<td>81.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security forces and local leaders provided reasonable explanations and specific guidance on the government...</td>
<td>80.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The COVID-19 controlling measures employed by security forces and local leaders were conducted with fairness and...</td>
<td>80.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security forces and local leaders were honest and polite with me.</td>
<td>79.70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Essential services such as healthcare, food shopping, banking or other emergence services were provided fairly.</td>
<td>79.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local leaders in my neighborhood delivered good support services for all citizens equally and transparently.</td>
<td>79.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The processes of supporting citizens involving local leaders in my neighborhood attempt to meet all citizen needs...</td>
<td>77.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security forces ‘communication with me was appropriate</td>
<td>77.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was fully satisfied with support received from government officials</td>
<td>70.80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How transparent was the selection of the most relevant beneficiaries of relief items (food and sanitation items) by the Government of Rwanda during COVID-19?

- Don't know: 8.50%
- Not sure: 25.60%
- Not transparent: 2.90%
- Somewhat transparent: 14.60%
- Transparent: 39.70%
- Very transparent: 8.60%
“The security guards of motorcyclists are very corrupt. The first day when motorcyclists were allowed to resume their work after the covid-19 lockdown, I had no insurance. In addition, I had no money and used my driving permit as a collateral to get the sanitizer from the pharmacy. When the security guard caught me driving without the permits, he told me to give the bribe of 10,000Rwf. Because I had no money, I agreed to bribe him 5,000Rwf. To get the whole amount, I called my friend who lent me 3,000Rwf and added it to 2,000Rwf that I had.” A motorcyclist in Kigali narrated his ordeal during the FGD.
CORRUPTION AND OTHER MALPRACTICES AS CONSEQUENCE OF LACK OF STANDARDIZED FINES FOR VIOLATION OF COVID-19 PREVENTIVE MEASURES

A respondent in Nyamagabe testified: “As a way to terrify businesspeople and give them something (bribe), the local leaders used to close boutiques/shops before the curfew hour deadline. Moreover, there were some who could exceed the hours and no one could close their businesses. When we tried to inform them (local leaders) that there were many others working after the curfew, they responded: “Who chose you to be a journalist?”

Another FGD participant said in Gahunga, Burera District: “Police did not have good behaviors in Gahunga sector (Burera district). They used excessive power to force citizens close shops and go home before the curfew hour. There is a case of a police officer who continuously beat citizens here in Gahunga Centre. Fortunately, he was deployed in another region when citizens tirelessly claimed that he was beating them every day”.

“While arresting people who broke covid-19 preventive measures, sometimes RNP officers did not observe social distancing measures as to reduce the risks of the spread of the pandemic. There are cases of citizens who were parked together in the same cars by the police officers without obeying social distancing measures.” A participant said in the FGD.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Feeling of injustice for culprits</th>
<th>It encouraged some authorities to ask for bribe</th>
<th>Others</th>
<th>It encouraged some authorities to over fine culprits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>29.80%</td>
<td>29.00%</td>
<td>27.80%</td>
<td>13.40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXPERIENCE OF CORRUPTION DURING COVID-19 LOCKDOWN

90.7% didn’t experience corruption (bribery, nepotism, favoritism, sexual favor or gift) during COVID-19

Salon stylist in Kicukiro testified: “Our salon sometimes does not obey curfew hours because our boss bribes Security guys (Inkeragutabara) and they ensure our safety and security when we have many clients in the night. They are the ones who let us know that police are coming.”

A motorcyclist in Kigali pointed out this during the FGD: “I was arrested after the curfew hour and charged 10,000Rwf fines. Later in the morning, one of the people who had arrested me in my village brought the receipt of only 1,000Rwf indicating that I had paid the fees for security night patrol - ‘amafaranga y’umutekano.’”
A motorcyclist in Kigali testified during the FGD: “The federation of motorcyclists announced that all of us got the support but it is not true. The presidents of cooperatives distributed the support a few motorcyclists selected basing on nepotism and favoritism. When our cooperative supported 10 of those selected members, they announced that all 50 members received the support”

A waiter in a bar (bar-turned restaurant) in Kigali shared her experience with sexual exploitation sparked by Covid-19 pandemic situation after the lockdown: ”There is a high prevalence of corruption and sexual exploitation in hotels and bars. It happened to me! When hotel operations were resumed amid the Covid-19, a friend of mine told me she had got a job for me in a good hotel outside Kigali. The Owner sent me a ticket and I boarded a taxi to go to meet him. He told me: If a client is happy with you, you should accept to sleep with him. You will have to use our room and I will dismiss you if I find out that you accept go to another lodge with the client. I asked him: Does your service package to your clients include girls? He responded: Girl, you cannot work here for so long! Anyway, I see you are very beautiful, would you accept to have sex with me if I want to? I directly left him and turned down his job offer:”
An FGD participant in Kigali revealed: “My friend was arrested after the curfew hour. She called me on phone and asked me to give her night jacket before being taken to the stadium. When I turned up, the night security person (Umunyerondo) demanded 7,000Rwf as bribe to free her and told us to use mobile money through another phone number that is not registered on his name. We ended up paying him 5,000 and let our friend go”.

A waiter in a bar (now a restaurant) narrated: “I met a friend and bought me a bottle of alcohol at a boutique. The police directly came and arrested us because it was after 9pm, the curfew hour. The owner of the boutique said: “Afande, are you for sure taking my clients?” We instantly started collecting money, like 2,000Rwf per person and gave it to the police officer who let us go scot-free”.

AVERAGE of bribe: 10,000Rwf
Groups of workers most affected by the covid-19 pandemic

- People working in trading services: 27.30%
- People working in agriculture and routine small businesses: 24.50%
- People working in motorcycle taxi activities: 16.10%
- People working in bicycle taxi activities: 11.70%
- People working in Bars: 8.40%
- People working in hair cutting salon/beautification: 3.80%
- People working in school teaching services: 2.90%
- People working in handcrafts and sewing services: 2.70%
- People working in mobile money services: 1.00%
- People working in Restaurant services: 0.90%
- People working in casual labor: 0.80%
Groups of workers most affected by the covid-19 pandemic

A shop owner in Gahunga, Burera District explained how she was affected by COVID-19: “I have now consumed my capital because I’m no longer making profit while I pay taxes. Before Covid-19, I could make over 8,000Rwf per day as a profit from my shop. Today I only get a profit of between 1,500Rwf – 2,000Rwf per day from my business.”

Waiter in a bar in Kigali revealed: “People in hotels and bars were dismissed and others are paid 30 – 50% of their salaries. When the bar resumed operations as a restaurant, our boss gave us two choices: 50% Pay cuts of all the employees or termination of the contracts of some. We all chose the paid cut because no one knew the one to be dismissed”

A bar owner in Kicukiro Kigali, whose business collapsed due to COVID-19 effect, narrated his ordeal: “I had invested all my money in a bar business and paid a six-month rent a few days before the outbreak of Covid-19. I had 11 workers and had purchased so many bottle crates. Due to effects of Covid-19, I lost everything and I am now a night security guard. I was able to feed my family at least three times a day (breakfast, lunch and dinner) but it is now very difficult to get food even once a day.”
EFFECTS OF COVID-19 ON PEOPLE’S LIFE

60.5%
Lack of money from income generating activities

17.1%
Lack of salary

8.5%
Difficulty to go and work for other people in exchange of foodstuff or money

7.2%
Other effects
“When I finished all my savings in the lockdown, I started facing direct effects of the pandemic. Getting meal was difficult and the number of times reduced. Sometimes, I could eat nothing the whole day. I lost weight and became slim due to hunger. When I will go back to school, I think my students will not recognise me,” said a participant during the FGD.
Some families decided to move from expensive rent houses to cheaper ones. A Primary Private school teacher in Gikondo, Kicukiro narrated: “The landlord used to tell me that he would dismiss me because I was not able to pay rent and electricity and water bills. At the end of the day, I decided to leave and rent a cheap house in June. Due to financial incapability, I also moved again to another house (the third one amid covid-19) in August”.

A motorcyclist operating in Remera Sector expressed his concern during the FGD: “When the lockdown ended, I immediately moved to a very small and cheap ghetto. Most of motorcyclists have moved to cheap and affordable houses where they pay at least 10,000Rwf. The challenge is that those houses are found far in the city and we drive a long distance coming to work”.
EXTENT OF EFFECTS OF COVID-19 ON ACCESSING HEALTH SERVICES

A participant in FGD in Musanze, Cyuve explained during the FGD: "Due to lack of transport facilities, it took me three hours to transport my wife with a bicycle to the hospital. We could usually use only 30 minutes but there were no other means of transport".

Due to hardship, some people delayed to go to hospital until the sickness became very serious. A Bar worker in Gikondo, Kigali narrated during the FGD: "My mother seriously fell sick but I did not take to the hospital because I had no money. When I saw she was not recovering, I went to a community health worker (Umujyanama w’ubuzima) and diagnosed her with malaria. Due to a delay to get treatments, my mother was negatively affected and is, as yet, suffering from back pain".
RECOMMENDATIONS

• To the Government in general:
  
i. Corruption among the ear-marked categories of service providers (especially the Local leaders) should be curbed in order to avoid compromising the COVID-19 preventive efforts. The aim should be to promote fairness, transparency, integrity and accountability in order to improve COVID Response outcomes in the country. In this regard the office of the Ombudsman should enhance its surveillance and detective actions to effectively and extensively identify the perpetrators of corruption and subject them to fair treatment as per the laws governing the country.

ii. The Government should set standardized fines for violated COVID-19 preventive measures in order to avoid consequences of unfair charging of culprits, over fining culprits and other consequences.
RECOMMENDATIONS

To the citizens:

i. The citizens should enhance their compliance levels as regards COVID-19 preventive measures.

ii. To continue monitoring the way public services are provided to them in view of fairness, transparency, integrity and accountability.

To the CSOs:

i. To monitor the quality of public service delivery especially through listening to citizens’ concerns. In particular, to record or capture from citizens, testimonies of alleged unfair/corrupt service delivery and then engage the relevant authorities to appropriately address the concerns.

ii. To engage in advocacy work on COVID-19 Response issues and concerns of the citizens. In particular, to advocate for transparency, fairness, accountability and integrity in public service delivery.
RECOMMENDATIONS

• To FERWACOTAMO (Federation of Motorcycle Cooperatives in Cooperatives)

i. The federation of motorcycle federation (FERWACOTAMO) to maximize its efforts to curb corruption that prevails among taxi-moto supervisors. In Kigali, motorcyclists underscore that the Covid-19 effects sparked the situation and that those supervisors have come up with new tricks and new slang called “ZAKEHOSE” to demand bribes. According to motorcyclists, ZAKEHOSE in full means IMBABURA ZAKEHOSE (let Charcoal cooker be lightened in all households – in the home of motorcyclist and the tax moto supervisor). The slang is used by taxi-moto supervisors to demand corruption from motorcyclists.

ii. FERWACOTAMO should work with institutions mandated to fight against corruption to review and probe the process of distribution of the support to motorcyclists affected by Covid-19. Motorcyclists underpin that the presidents of cooperatives were corrupt and demand accountability so that those who are responsible for mismanagement and embezzlement may be identified and brought to justice. There are motorcyclists who did not receive the government support just because their federation and cooperatives had announced that they supported them.
RECOMMENDATIONS

- To Rwanda Hospitality Association (RHA), RIB and Prosecution:

There is a need of collaboration with anti-corruption institutions to fight sexual exploitation and corruption in hotels and bars in Rwanda. From the discussions with bar and hotel workers countrywide, it emerged that COVID-19 has led to escalation of the situation. As operations have been halted by the pandemic, some proprietors and managers demand bribes or sexual corruption to resume the contracts with workers (especially young girls) while others are forced to have sex with clients.

- To Ministry of Education (MINEDUC) and private schools:

MINEDUC should advocate for teachers in private schools so that they at least get special government support or motivation. Amid the pandemic, there are many teachers who did not get the government support while their contracts had been suspended and/or terminated.
THANK YOU!

www.tirwanda.org

Email: info@tirwanda.org
Facebook: Transparency International Rwanda
Twitter: @TI_Rwanda